

POSSIBLE ACTIONS FOR OUR SANCTUARY FACADE

A. Restore Sanctuary façade in accordance with assessment from THP and plans created by MSA

PLUS	MINUS
We would be fully restoring and preserving our architecturally unique mid-century façade.	The cost for restoration of the façade is estimated at approximately \$650,000.
We have now obtained a thorough professional investigation of the damage to the wall that has accrued during the past 60 years, which informs us about the needed structural repairs and how to prevent future damage.	A Capital Campaign will need to be conducted to raise these funds as we do not currently have \$650,000 in available funds.
Following restoration, adherence to a schedule for routine maintenance (every 5 years or so) will preserve what we have done.	
This restoration would be the first major expense for the facade since the sanctuary was built in 1960.	
There might be some possibility of a grant to support this work.	
This plan is actually more financially feasible than the other possible actions outlined below.	

B. Replace existing sanctuary façade with a simple and potentially less expensive design (“brick wall with windows”)

PLUS	MINUS
MAY cost slightly less than restoring the existing wall.	Actual cost is unknown. Our contractor gave a “ballpark estimate” of \$400,000 but this would be dependent upon the design of the wall and it does not include the cost of the design work required to create the plans for a new wall.
This could create a wall that would not have the structural difficulties present in our current façade.	Design for a new wall would likely cost a minimum of \$50,000 and a one-year process to obtain a design that could be bid to contractors for a formal price.
	St. John’s would lose its iconic sanctuary façade.
	The congregation would need to agree upon a new design for the wall.
	The timeline for building a different wall would be uncertain, due to required planning time and impact of weather upon scheduling construction.
	A Capital Campaign will need to be conducted to raise these funds as we do not currently have \$400,000+ in available funds.
	A new wall carries with it uncertainty and could potentially have issues of its own in the future.
	There could be zoning issues if we make major changes in the building.

C. Sell our present building and buy another facility

PLUS	MINUS
Instead of spending \$650,000 to restore our façade, we could downsize &/or spend less for a different building.	Sale of the building will likely not result in a substantial financial gain. A buyer of our property may want to simply obtain the land and not use the current building. The old building and land across the street (where two houses are now being built) was sold by the Catholic church for \$225,000. With recent increases in the real estate market, we could round that to \$300,000. See Appendix A for examples of other church properties that have been sold.
If we believe that the current St. John's facility cannot meet our needs in the future, this may be the best decision. We could look for a building that better meets our congregation's desires and needs.	Volunteers would be needed to form a new team to search for other properties and steer this process. We may need to engage the services of a commercial real estate agent to assist us.
If we don't believe we can adequately maintain the St. John's facility in the future, it may be better to buy a building that we can afford to maintain on an ongoing basis.	A review of purchase options for similar space would be needed. Any building we purchase is likely to require at least some remodeling, adding to the cost and ongoing maintenance.
	The congregation would need to agree on a new location, the purchase of a new building and remodeling plans. Timing for decision-making on these issues could be driven by market conditions, requiring quick action or potentially the delegation of decision-making to the Board instead of the full congregation.
	With the amount of resources we would likely have from the sale of our current property and fundraising efforts, there would be limits on what properties we could afford to buy and/or renovate to meet our needs.
	A change of physical location could impact membership.
	The negative environmental impact of demolishing our building doesn't match our 7 th principle.

D. Sell our present building and rent another facility

PLUS	MINUS
Instead of spending \$650,000 to restore our façade, we could downsize &/or spend less to rent a different building.	Same as POSSIBILITY C - Sale of the building will likely not result in a substantial financial gain.
If we believe that the current St. John's facility cannot meet our needs in the future, this may be the best decision. We could look for a building to rent that better meets our congregation's desires and needs.	A building rental of "sanctuary" space may come to approximately \$600 - \$1500 per Sunday. This will cost \$31,200 - \$78,000 per year.

If we don't believe we can adequately maintain the St. John's facility in the future, this would eliminate this problem as we would not own a building that we have to maintain.	Operating budget would be used to pay the rental cost. The proceeds from the sale of the Resor building would be spent to pay rent for a few years.
Possibility of better parking.	Loss of Office Space and congregational meeting space, or additional costs would need to be incurred to accommodate those meetings.
There would be no need for a capital campaign.	Maintenance of the property (handled by a landlord) with a long-term rental may not meet our needs.
	Loss of treasured worship space in present location. Question of what would happen with our Bertoia and other large artwork.
	Volunteers would be needed to form a new team to search for rental properties and steer this process. We may need to engage the services of a commercial real estate agent to assist us.
	The congregation would need to agree on a new location and rental building. Timing for decision-making on these contractual issues could be driven by market conditions, requiring quick action or potentially the delegation of decision-making to the Board instead of the full congregation.
	Potential loss of church community with building rental.
	A loss of permanent location and the change of physical location could impact membership.
	The negative environmental impact of demolishing our building doesn't match our 7 th principle.

E. Sell our present building and merge with another area UU congregation

PLUS	MINUS
Instead of spending \$650,000 to restore our façade, we could join with other area UUs and worship in their space (or in a new third location).	The 200+ year history of St. John's would end with us. Loss of treasured worship space in present location. Question of what would happen with our Bertoia and other large artwork.
If we believe that having St. John's unique presence in Cincinnati is not necessary for us and future generations of Unitarian Universalists, this may be the best decision.	Same as POSSIBILITY C regarding unknown sale price for our building and property.
This option eliminates the need to worry about our present building.	We may need to engage the services of a church merger specialist. Our congregation would need to agree with another congregation to join together. Then a decision would be needed whether to remain at their facility or find a new location for the combined congregation.
This would result in less operating expenses for the combined congregations.	Volunteers would be needed to form a new team to steer this complex process.
There will be no need for a capital campaign to raise funds for our facilities.	A change of physical location and "closure" of St. John's could impact membership.

	Often, when congregations merge, there is significant turn-over in ministerial and operational staff.
	It is unclear what would happen with the various assets of St. John's, including our Bertoia and other large artwork.
	The negative environmental impact of demolishing our building doesn't match our 7 th principle.

F. Ignore or teardown the Sanctuary, Use the remainder of the building for Offices, and Rent Sanctuary space elsewhere

PLUS	MINUS
Instead of spending \$650,000 to restore our façade, we could spend less to rent worship space.	All requirements related to locating rental space that are outlined for Possibility D would apply for renting sanctuary space.
	A building rental may come to approximately \$600 - \$1500 per Sunday. This will cost \$31,200 - \$78,000 per year.
	Loss of treasured worship space in present location. Question of what would happen with our Bertoia and other large artwork.
	Remainder of the building still needs to be maintained/improved.
	We would incur additional rental expense without cost offset from selling property.
	Capital Campaign would likely be canceled.

G. Do Nothing

PLUS	MINUS
We've tried it already.	It didn't fix our problems
It's free (in the short term)	... and it's a lot more expensive in the long run.
There will be no capital campaign to raise funds for our facilities. Your Master Planning Team and Capital Campaign Leaders can have their lives back.	

Appendix A: Local Church Property Listings

321 Resor Avenue

Demolition of Church space across the street from St. John's

Appears to have sold in 2021 for \$225,000

Hyde Park Baptist Church

Unclear what the property sold for, Investment of \$20M into the existing space

https://www.terrexllc.com/20-million-development-to-start-on-hyde-park-square/?utm_source=rss&utm_medium=rss&utm_campaign=20-million-development-to-start-on-hyde-park-square

<https://local12.com/news/local/cincinnati-ohio-20-million-development-luxury-apartment-building-start-hyde-park-square-flats-oakley-terrex-development-construction-baptist-church-2745-erie-ave-luxury-apartment-building>

Monastery - Hyde Park Community United Methodist Church

Purchased by United Methodist for \$1.1M in 2001. Was listed in 2013 for \$2M. Unclear what price it sold for. Demolished and turned into homes.

<https://www.bizjournals.com/cincinnati/news/2013/09/06/new-million-dollar-homes-are-coming-to.html>

Seventh Presbyterian Church (1725 Madison Rd)

Purchase Price: \$350,000, Total Investment: \$5M

<https://www.bizjournals.com/cincinnati/news/2015/08/17/exclusive-developer-converting-former-church-into.html>

The project, located at the former Seventh Presbyterian Church 1725 Madison Road, would demolish portions of the church, saving the tower and front façade, which includes the west entrance and angled wall, the vestibule and the baptistry. In its place, Great Traditions will build 10 single family, semi-detached houses with garages.

Miscellaneous

<https://www.lex18.com/news/political/national/ohio-mls-team-wants-to-demolish-154-year-old-church-to-build-new-250-mil-soccer-stadium>

OTR Transept (Honorable Mention)

Renovation Investment: \$4.7M, Purchase Price: \$240,000

<https://www.bizjournals.com/cincinnati/news/2015/10/07/otr-church-opens-its-doors-to-show-off-new-event.html>

<https://www.cincinnati.com/story/money/2014/07/08/transept-entertainment-venue-otr/12376111/>

Renovation of St. Michael the Archangel

Investment of \$1M - \$8M into Renovation for community center

<https://www.soapboxmedia.com/devnews/030513.stmichaelsdevelopment.aspx>

<https://www.fox19.com/story/28604438/st-michael-the-archangel-church-renovating-into-multi-purpose-building-in-price-hill/>

<https://www.wlwt.com/article/peek-inside-the-sanctuary-the-renovated-st-michael-the-archangel-church/3552650>